

Isotopic Ratios in Comets

E. Jehin, J. Manfroid, D. Hutsemékers, C. Arpigny, J.-M. Zucconi

Earth Moon and Planets submitted, May 2009

Table1 : Isotopic ratios in comets. The terrestrial value is indicated for each ratio. When several references are available for one comet, the value quoted has been taken from the last citation. We give in column “Type” the comet classifications according to Levison (1996) : Halley-family (HF) ($T_J < 2$ and $a < 40$ AU), external (EXT) ($T_J < 2$ and $40 < a < 10000$), new ($T_J < 2$ and $a > 10000$) and Jupiter-Family (JF) ($2 < T_J < 3$) with T_J , the Tisserand parameter for Jupiter.

Isotopic ratio D/H :

Comets	Type	Method (facility)	Species	D/H ($1.56 \cdot 10^{-4}$)	Ref.	Notes
1P/Halley	HF	mass spectro (Giotto)	H ₂ DO ⁺	$(3.08 \pm 0.5) \cdot 10^{-4}$	4	
1P/Halley	HF	mass spectro (Giotto)	H ₂ DO ⁺	$(3.06 \pm 0.34) \cdot 10^{-4}$	11	
8P/Tuttle	HF	near IR spectro (VLT CRIRES)	HDO	$(4.09 \pm 1.45) \cdot 10^{-4}$	33	
81P/Wild2	JF	laboratory NanoSIMS (Stardust)	D	$[10^{-4} - 10^{-3}]$	27	
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (JCMT)	HDO	$(3.3 \pm 0.8) \cdot 10^{-4}$	28	
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (JCMT)	DCN	$(2.3 \pm 0.4) \cdot 10^{-3}$	29	
C/1996 B2 (Hyakutake)	EXT	radio spectro (CSO)	HDO	$(2.9 \pm 1.0) \cdot 10^{-4}$	7	
C/2001 Q4 (NEAT)	NEW	UV spectro (HST STIS)	D	$(4.6 \pm 1.4) \cdot 10^{-4}$	34	
C/2002 T7 (LINEAR)	NEW	near UV spectro (VLT UVES)	OD	$(2.5 \pm 0.7) \cdot 10^{-4}$	13	

Isotopic ratio $^{12}\text{C}/^{13}\text{C}$:

Comets	Type	Method (facility)	Species	$^{12}\text{C}/^{13}\text{C}$ (89)	Ref.	Notes
1P/Halley	HF	optical spectro (AAT)	^{13}CN	89 ± 17	14	
1P/Halley	HF	optical spectro (1.9m Mt Stromlo)	^{13}CN	95 ± 12	20	
8P/Tuttle	HF	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	90 ± 20	18	
9P/Tempell	JF	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	95 ± 15	16	Before impact
9P/Tempell	JF	optical spectro (HIRES KeckI)	^{13}CN	95 ± 15	16	Just after impact
17P/Holmes	JF	radio spectro (30m IRAM)	H^{13}CN	114 ± 26	8	During outburst
17P/Holmes	JF	optical spectro (2DC McDonald + HIRES KeckI)	^{13}CN	90 ± 20	8	During outburst
73-B/SW3	JF	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	100 ± 30	17	Split comet
73-C/SW3	JF	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	100 ± 20	17	Split comet
122P/de Vico	HF	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	^{13}CN	90 ± 10	15, 26	
153P/Ikeya-Zhang	EXT	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	^{13}CN	80 ± 30	15, 26	
81P/Wild2	JF	laboratory NanoSIMS (Stardust)	$^{13}\text{C}^-$	[90 - 94]	27	
88P/Howell	JF	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	90 ± 15	12, 26	
C/1963 A1 (Ikeya)	EXT	optical spectro (Hale Palomar Coudé)	$^{12}\text{C}^{13}\text{C}$	70 ± 15	31	
C/1969 T1 (Tago-Sato-Kosaka)	EXT	optical spectro (Hale Palomar Coudé)	$^{12}\text{C}^{13}\text{C}$	100 ± 20	30	
C/1973 E1 (Kohoutek)	NEW	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	$^{12}\text{C}^{13}\text{C}$	115 ± 30	10	
C/1975 N1 (Kobayashi-Berger-Milon)	NEW	optical spectro	$^{12}\text{C}^{13}\text{C}$	100 ± 30	32	

C/1975 V1 (West)	EXT	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	$^{12}\text{C}^{13}\text{C}$	[60-90]	21	
C/1989 X1 (Austin)	NEW	optical spectro (1.9m Mt Stromlo)	^{13}CN	85 ± 20	35	
C/1989 Q1 (Okazaki-Levy-Rudenko)	NEW	optical spectro (1.9m Mt Stromlo)	^{13}CN	93 ± 20	35	
C/1990 K1 (Levy)	NEW	optical spectro (1.9m Mt Stromlo)	^{13}CN	90 ± 10	35	
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (JCMT)	H^{13}CN	111 ± 12	19	
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (CSO)	H^{13}CN	90 ± 15	24	
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (12m NRAO)	H^{13}CN	109 ± 22	36	
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	^{13}CN	90 ± 20	2, 3, 26	At $R_h = 0.9$ AU
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	optical spectro (SOFIN NOT)	^{13}CN	100 ± 30	2, 3, 26	At $R_h = 0.9$ AU
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	^{13}CN	80 ± 25	26	At $R_h = 2.7$ AU
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (JCMT)	H^{13}CN	94 ± 8	8	
C/1996 B2 (Hyakutake)	EXT	radio spectro (CSO)	H^{13}CN	34 ± 12	23	Line contamination
C/1999 S4 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	^{13}CN	90 ± 30	12, 26	
C/1999 T1 (McNaught-Hartley)	EXT	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	^{13}CN	80 ± 20	26	
C/2000 WM1 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	100 ± 20	3, 26	
C/2001 Q4 (NEAT)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	90 ± 15	25, 26	At $R_h = 1.0$ AU
C/2001 Q4 (NEAT)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	70 ± 30	25, 26	At $R_h = 3.7$ AU
C/2002 X5 (Kudo-Fujikawa)	EXT	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	90 ± 20	26	
C/2002 V1 (NEAT)	EXT	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	100 ± 20	26	
C/2002 Y1 (Juels-Holvorcem)	EXT	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	90 ± 20	26	
C/2002 T7 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	^{13}CN	85 ± 20	26	

C/2003 K4 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	¹³ CN	80 ± 20	25, 26	At R _h = 2.6 AU
C/2003 K4 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	¹³ CN	90 ± 20	25, 26	At R _h = 1.2 AU
C/2006 M4 (SWAN)	NEW	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	¹³ CN	95 ± 25	26	
C/2007 N3 (Lulin)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	¹³ CN	105 ± 40	26	

Isotopic ratio ¹⁴N/¹⁵N :

Comets	Type	Method (facility)	Species	¹⁴ N/ ¹⁵ N (272)	Ref.	Notes
8P/Tuttle	HF	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	150 ± 30	18	
9P/Tempell	JF	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	145 ± 20	16	Before impact
9P/Tempell	JF	optical spectro (HIRES KeckI)	C ¹⁵ N	165 ± 30	16	Just after impact
17P/Holmes	JF	radio spectro (30m IRAM)	HC ¹⁵ N	139 ± 26	8	During outburst
17P/Holmes	JF	optical spectro (2DC McDonald + HIRES KeckI)	C ¹⁵ N	165 ± 40	8	During outburst
73-B/SW3	JF	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	210 ± 50	17	Split comet
73-C/SW3	JF	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	220 ± 40	17	Split comet
81P/Wild2	JF	laboratory NanoSIMS (Stardust)	C ¹⁵ N ⁻	[118 - 270]	27	
88P/Howell	JF	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	140 ± 20	12, 26	
122P/de Vico	HF	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	C ¹⁵ N	145 ± 20	15, 26	
153P/Ikeya-Zhang	EXT	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	C ¹⁵ N	140 ± 50	15, 26	
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (JCMT)	HC ¹⁵ N	323 ± 46	19	
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (12m NRAO)	HC ¹⁵ N	330 ± 98	36	

C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	C ¹⁵ N	150 ± 30	2, 3, 26	At R _h = 0.9 AU
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	optical spectro (SOFIN NOT)	C ¹⁵ N	135 ± 40	2, 3 26	At R _h = 0.9 AU
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	C ¹⁵ N	130 ± 40	26	At R _h = 2.7 AU
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (JCMT)	HC ¹⁵ N	205 ± 70	8	
C/1999 S4 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	C ¹⁵ N	150 ± 50	12, 26	
C/1999 T1 (McNaught-Hartley)	EXT	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	C ¹⁵ N	160 ± 50	26	
C/2000 WM1 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	150 ± 30	3, 26	
C/2001 Q4 (NEAT)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	130 ± 40	25, 26	At R _h = 3.7 AU
C/2001 Q4 (NEAT)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	135 ± 20	25, 26	At R _h = 1.0 AU
C/2002 X5 (Kudo-Fujikawa)	EXT	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	130 ± 20	26	
C/2002 V1 (NEAT)	EXT	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	160 ± 35	26	
C/2002 Y1 (Juels-Holvorcem)	EXT	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	150 ± 35	26	
C/2002 T7 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	160 ± 25	26	
C/2003 K4 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	150 ± 35	25, 26	At R _h = 2.6 AU
C/2003 K4 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	145 ± 25	25, 26	At R _h = 1.2 AU
C/2006 M4 (SWAN)	NEW	optical spectro (2DC McDonald)	C ¹⁵ N	145 ± 50	26	
C/2007 N3 (Lulin)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	C ¹⁵ N	150 ± 50	26	

Isotopic ratio ¹⁶O/¹⁸O :

Comets	Type	Method (facility)	Species	¹⁶ O/ ¹⁸ O (499)	Ref.	Notes
1P/Halley	HF	mass spectro (Giotto)	H ₂ ¹⁸ O	518 ± 45	4	

1P/Halley	HF	mass spectro (Giotto)	H ₂ ¹⁸ O	470 ± 40	11	
81P/Wild2	JF	laboratory NanoSIMS (Stardust)	minerals	[490 - 520]	27	
153P/Ikeya-Zhang	EXT	radio spectro (Odin)	H ₂ ¹⁸ O	530 ± 60	22, 5	
C/2001 Q4 (NEAT)	NEW	radio spectro (Odin)	H ₂ ¹⁸ O	530 ± 60	5	
C/2002 T7 (LINEAR)	NEW	radio spectro (Odin)	H ₂ ¹⁸ O	550 ± 75	5	
C/2002 T7 (LINEAR)	NEW	optical spectro (VLT UVES)	¹⁸ OH	425 ± 55	13	
C/2004 Q2 (Machholz)	EXT	radio spectro (Odin)	H ₂ ¹⁸ O	508 ± 33	5	

Isotopic ratio ³²S/³⁴S :

Comets	Type	Method (facility)	Species	³² S/ ³⁴ S (23)	Ref.	Notes
1P/Halley	HF	mass spectro (Giotto)	³⁴ S+	23 ± 6	4	
17P/Holmes	JF	radio spectro (30m IRAM)	C ³⁴ S	16 ± 3	6	
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (JCMT)	C ³⁴ S	27 ± 3	19	
C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)	EXT	radio spectro (30m IRAM)	H ₂ ³⁴ S	16 ± 3	9	

References :

[1] Altwegg (1996), habilitationsschrift, Univ. of Bern

[2] Arpigny, C.; Schulz, R.; Manfroid, J.; Ilyin, I.; Stüwe, J. A.; Zucconi, J.-M. “The isotope ratios $^{12}\text{C}/^{13}\text{C}$ and $^{14}\text{N}/^{15}\text{N}$ in comet C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)”, Bull. Amer. Astron. Soc., 32, 1074 (2000)

[3] Arpigny, C.; Jehin, E.; Manfroid, J.; Hutsemékers, D.; Schulz, R.; Stüwe, J. A.; Zucconi, J.-M.; Ilyin, I., “Anomalous Nitrogen Isotope Ratio in Comets”, Science, Volume 301, Issue 5639, pp. 1522-1525 (2003)

[4] Balsiger H., Altwegg, K.; Geiss, J., “D/H and O-18/O-16 ratio in the hydronium ion and in neutral water from in situ ion measurements in comet Halley”, Journal of Geophysical Research, vol. 100, no. A4, p. 5827-5834 (1995)

[5] Biver, N.; Bockelée-Morvan, D.; Crovisier, J.; Lecacheux, A.; Frisk, U.; Hjalmarson, Å.; Olberg, M.; Florén, H.-G.; Sandqvist, A.; Kwok, S., “Submillimetre observations of comets with Odin: 2001 2005”, Planetary and Space Science, Volume 55, Issue 9, p. 1058-1068 (2007)

[6] Biver, N.; Bockelée-Morvan, D.; Crovisier, J.; Lecacheux, A.; Lis, D. C.; Boissier, J.; Colom, P.; Dello-Russo, N.; Florén, H.-G.; Frisk, U., et al. « In-Depth Investigation of the Fragmenting Comet 73P/Schwassmann-Wachmann 3 at Radio Wavelengths with the Nançay, IRAM, CSO, APEX and Odin Radio Telescopes” , Asteroids, Comets, Meteors 2008 held July 14-18, 2008 in Baltimore, Maryland. LPI Contribution No. 1405, paper id. 8149 (2008)

[7] Bockelée-Morvan, D.; Gautier, D.; Lis, D. C.; Young, K.; Keene, J.; Phillips, T.; Owen, T.; Crovisier, J.; Goldsmith, P. F.; Bergin, E. A.; Despois, D.; Wootten, A., “Deuterated Water in Comet C/1996 B2 (Hyakutake) and Its Implications for the Origin of Comets” , Icarus, Volume 133, Issue 1, pp. 147-162 (1998)

- [8] Bockelée-Morvan, D.; Biver, N.; Jehin, E.; Cochran, A. L.; Wiesemeyer, H.; Manfroid, J.; Hutsemékers, D.; Arpigny, C.; Boissier, J.; Cochran, W.; et al. , “Large Excess of Heavy Nitrogen in Both Hydrogen Cyanide and Cyanogen from Comet 17P/Holmes”, *The Astrophysical Journal*, Volume 679, Issue 1, pp. L49-L52 (2008)
- [9] Crovisier, J.; Bockelée-Morvan, D.; Colom, P.; Biver, N.; Despois, D.; Lis, D. C, “ The composition of ices in comet C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp) from radio spectroscopy. Further results and upper limits on undetected species”, *Astronomy and Astrophysics*, v.418, p.1141-1157 (2004)
- [10] Danks, A. C.; Lambert, D. L.; Arpigny, C, “The C-12/C-13 ratio in comet Kohoutek (1973f)”, *The Astrophysical Journal*, vol. 194, p. 745-751 (1974)
- [11] Eberhardt P.; Reber, M.; Krankowsky, D.; Hodges, R. R., “The D/H and $^{18}\text{O}/^{16}\text{O}$ ratios in water from comet P/Halley”, *Astronomy and Astrophysics*, v.302, p.301 (1995)
- [12] Hutsemékers, D.; Manfroid, J.; Jehin, E.; Arpigny, C.; Cochran, A.; Schulz, R.; Stüwe, J. A.; Zucconi, J.-M., « Isotopic abundances of carbon and nitrogen in Jupiter-family and Oort Cloud comets”, *Astronomy and Astrophysics*, Volume 440, Issue 2, pp.L21-L24 (2005)
- [13] Hutsemékers, D; Manfroid, J.; Jehin, E.; Zucconi, J.-M.; Arpigny, C., “The $^{16}\text{OH}/^{18}\text{OH}$ and OD/OH isotope ratios in comet C/2002 T7 (LINEAR)”, *Astronomy and Astrophysics*, Volume 490, Issue 3, pp.L31-L34 (2008)
- [14] Jaworski, W. A.; Tatum, J. B, “Analysis of the swings effect and Greenstein effect in Comet P/Halley”, *The Astrophysical Journal*, vol. 377, p. 306-317 (1991)
- [15] Jehin, E.; Manfroid, J.; Cochran, A. L.; Arpigny, C.; Zucconi, J.-M.; Hutsemékers, D.; Cochran, W. D.; Endl, M.; Schulz, R., “The Anomalous $^{14}\text{N}/^{15}\text{N}$ Ratio in Comets 122P/1995 S1 (de Vico) and 153P/2002 C1 (Ikeya-Zhang)”, *The Astrophysical Journal*, Volume 613, Issue 2, pp. L161-L164 (2004)

- [16] Jehin, E.; Manfroid, J.; Hutsemékers, D.; Cochran, A. L.; Arpigny, C.; Jackson, W. M.; Rauer, H.; Schulz, R.; Zucconi, J.-M., “Deep Impact: High-Resolution Optical Spectroscopy with the ESO VLT and the Keck I Telescope”, *The Astrophysical Journal*, Volume 641, Issue 2, pp. L145-L148 (2006)
- [17] Jehin, E.; Manfroid, J.; Kawakita, H.; Hutsemékers, D.; Weiler, M.; Arpigny, C.; Cochran, A.; Hainaut, O.; Rauer, H.; Schulz, R.; Zucconi, J.-M., “Optical Spectroscopy of the B and C Fragments of Comet 73P/Schwassmann-Wachmann 3 at the ESO VLT”, *Asteroids, Comets, Meteors 2008* held July 14-18, 2008 in Baltimore, Maryland. LPI Contribution No. 1405, paper id. 8319 (2008)
- [18] E. Jehin, D. Bockelée-Morvan, N. Dello Russo, J. Manfroid, D. Hutsemékers, H. Kawakita, H. Kobayashi, R. Schulz, A. Smette, J. Stüwe, M. Weiler, C. Arpigny, N. Biver, A. Cochran, J. Crovisier, P. Magain, H. Rauer, H. Sana, R.J. Vervack, H. Weaver, J.-M. Zucconi, “A multi-wavelength simultaneous study of the composition of the Halley Family Comet 8P/Tuttle”, submitted to *EM&P* (2009)
- [19] Jewitt, D.C., Matthews, H.E., Owen, T., and Meier, R., “The $^{12}\text{C}/^{13}\text{C}$, $^{14}\text{N}/^{15}\text{N}$ and $^{32}\text{S}/^{34}\text{S}$ Isotope Ratios in Comet Hale-Bopp (C/1995 O1)”, *Science*, Vol. 278, p.90-93 (1997)
- [20] Kleine, M., Wyckoff, S., Wehinger, P., & Peterson, B.A. “The carbon isotope abundance ratio in comet Halley”, *The Astrophysical Journal*, vol. 439, no. 2, p. 1021-1033 (1995)
- [21] Lambert, D. L.; Danks, A. C., “High-resolution spectra of C2 Swan bands from comet West 1976 VI”, *Astrophysical Journal*, vol. 268, p. 428-446 (1983)
- [22] Lecacheux, A.; Biver, N.; Crovisier, J.; Bockelée-Morvan, D.; Baron, P.; Booth, R. S.; Encrenaz, P.; Florén, H.-G.; Frisk, U.; Hjalmarson, Å et al., “Observations of water in comets with Odin”, *Astronomy and Astrophysics*, v.402, p.L55-L58 (2003)

- [23] Lis, D. C.; Keene, J.; Young, K.; Phillips, T. G.; Bockelee-Morvan, D.; Crovisier, J.; Schilke, P.; Goldsmith, P. F.; Bergin, E. A. , “Spectroscopic Observations of Comet C/1996 B2 (Hyakutake) with the Caltech Submillimeter Observatory”, *Icarus*, Volume 130, Issue 2, pp. 355-372 (1997)
- [24] Lis, D. C.; Mehringer, D. M.; Benford, D.; Gardner, M.; Phillips, T. G.; Bockelée-Morvan, D.; Biver, N.; Colom, P.; Crovisier, J.; Despois, D.; Rauer, H., “New Molecular Species in Comet C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp) Observed with the Caltech Ssubmillimeter Observatory”, *Earth, Moon, and Planets*, v. 78, Issue 1/3, p. 13-20 (1997)
- [25] Manfroid, J.; Jehin, E.; Hutsemékers, D.; Cochran, A.; Zucconi, J.-M.; Arpigny, C.; Schulz, R.; Stüwe, J. A., « Isotopic abundance of nitrogen and carbon in distant comets », *Astronomy and Astrophysics*, Volume 432, Issue 1, pp.L5-L8 (2005)
- [26] Manfroid et al. 2009, “The CN isotopic ratios in comets” submitted to *A&A*
- [27] McKeegan, K.D., Al’eon, J., Bradley, J., et al., “Isotopic Compositions of Cometary Matter Returned by Stardust”, *Science*, Volume 314, Issue 5806, pp. 1724- (2006).
- [28] Meier R.; Owen, T. C.; Matthews, H. E.; Jewitt, D. C.; Bockelée-Morvan, D.; Biver, N.; Crovisier, J.; Gautier, D., “A Determination of the HDO/H₂O Ratio in Comet C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp)”, *Science*, Vol. 279, Iss. 5352, p. 842 (1998)
- [29] Meier, R.; Owen, T. C.; Jewitt, D. C.; Matthews, H. E.; Senay, M.; Biver, N.; Bockelée-Morvan, D.; Crovisier, J.; Gautier, D., “Deuterium in Comet C/1995 O1 (Hale-Bopp): Detection of DCN”, *Science*, Vol. 279, Iss. 5357, p. 1707 (1998)
- [30] Owen, T. “The Isotope Ratio ¹²C/¹³C in Comet Tago-Sato (1969g)”, *Astrophysical Journal*, Vol. 184, pp. 33-44 (1973)

- [31] Stawikowski, A.; Greenstein, J. L. “The Isotope Ratio C^{12}/C^{13} in a Comet”, *Astrophysical Journal*, vol. 140, p.1280 (1964)
- [32] Vanysek, V., “Carbon isotope ratio in comets and interstellar matter”, *proceedings of Comets, asteroids, meteorites: Toledo, Ohio, University of Toledo, 1977*, p. 499-503 (1977)
- [33] Villanueva, G. L.; Mumma, M. J.; Bonev, B. P.; Di Santi, M. A.; Gibb, E. L.; Bönhardt, H.; Lippi, M., “A Sensitive Search for Deuterated Water in Comet 8p/Tuttle”, *The Astrophysical Journal Letters*, Volume 690, Issue 1, pp. L5-L9 (2009).
- [34] Weaver, H.A.; A'Hearn, M. F.; Arpigny, C.; Combi, M. R.; Feldman, P. D.; Tozzi, G.-P.; Dello Russo, N.; Festou, M. C. , “Atomic Deuterium Emission and the D/H Ratio in Comets”, *Asteroids, Comets, Meteors 2008 held July 14-18, 2008 in Baltimore, Maryland. LPI Contribution No. 1405, paper id. 8216.* (2008)
- [35] Wyckoff, S.; Kleine, M.; Peterson, B. A.; Wehinger, P. A.; Ziurys, L. M., “Carbon Isotope Abundances in Comets”, *The Astrophysical Journal*, Volume 535, Issue 2, pp. 991-999 (2000)
- [36] Ziurys, L.M., Savage, C.; Brewster, M. A.; Apponi, A. J.; Pesch, T. C.; Wyckoff, S., «Cyanide Chemistry in Comet Hale-Bopp (C/1995 O1)”, *The Astrophysical Journal*, Volume 527, Issue 1, pp. L67-L71 (1999)